From: Paul Farrell <paul@farrell.law>
Sent: Thursday, February 6, 2020 10:06 PM

To: Flahive Wu, Laura; Kearse, Anne; Patrick Lewis; Omar Aboulhosn; Fuller, Mike; Brandon Bogle; Peter

Mougey; Mark Pifko

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne; Mainigi, Enu; sruby@baileyglasser.com; AJ; Wadhwani, Neelum; Lora Chafin;

Heather Kropac; Porter, Luke S.; Mincer, Jonathan; Winner, Sonya; Keyes, Andy; Boranian, Steven J.; Gary, Brent R.; Salimbene, Michael J.; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy; Tammy Davis; Wakefield, Jeff; Rice, Dale;

ct2\_opioid\_team@mail-list.com; Winner, Sonya; Lynch, Mark

Subject: RE: EXTERNAL-RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-

cv-01665

Attachments: CT2\_Cabell\_Production Report\_02052020 (002).xlsx

### [EXTERNAL]

Dear Distributor Defendants,

Please accept this update on defensive discovery on behalf of the Cabell County Commission. The process for producing documents is as follows:

Step 1: Data Mapping

Step 2: Organization and custodian interviews

Step 3: Harvesting

Step 4: Processing

Step 5: Running of search terms

Step 6: Document review for responsiveness, privilege and confidentiality

Step 7: Production

As of today, we have harvested data and documents from the Cabell County Commission, Cabell County Sheriff, Cabell County Circuit Clerk, Cabell County Clerk, Cabell County Assessor, Cabell EMS, Cabell 911 and selective documents from the Cabell County Board of Health exceeding 322 GB.

We anticipate completion of all harvesting in the next two weeks. We have processed nearly all of the data harvested so far. Step 1 through Step 5 are nearly complete.

From this enormous data set, we ran your preliminary search terms (and re-ran the final terms agreed to last week) which resulted in 504,660 documents. Document review is complete on approximately 275,000 documents and we anticipate the remainder will be finished by the end of the month. A primary pass has revealed approximately 1,100 documents which we anticipate withholding for legal privilege or statutory confidentiality disclosure restrictions. I will be personally reviewing to determine whether any of these documents truly need to be withheld and will provide an update. My goal is to have zero documents on the privilege log.

Of the approximately 275,000 documents reviewed, we determined that approximately 110,000 are responsive. We have produced approximately 75% of these documents and the remainder are in a second tier review.

# 

Attached please find an index which attempts to outline the broad categories of documents we produced. Also please find attached a spreadsheet which identifies and describes the 94,398 documents we produced including the Bates number for each.

As we discussed on the telephone, we will not be producing documents from the Prosecutor's Office. We fail to see the facial relevance of these documents. We are producing the entire set of closed felony files (2006 to 2018) from the Circuit Clerk and the Sheriff's Incident Reports (1996 to present) and Closed Detective Files (2006 to present). If there are specific felony cases, incidents and/or files you wish to further investigate, we will reconsider our position. In the meantime, we have no intention of invading the internal work product of our prosecutor's office without a court order.

Also, we have determined that the Cabell County Board of Health is neither a state agency nor under the administrative/fiscal control of the Cabell County Commission. They are an independent entity not in the custody and control of Cabell County or the City of Huntington. We have harvested and disclosed some 26,000 documents but halted further disclosures until we sort out legal representation.

Finally, we have harvested documents from 93 organizational or individual custodians of which 53 have been produced. We anticipate the remainder will be produced by the end of the month.

# Paul T. Farrell, Jr., Esq.

FARRELL LAW P.O. Box 1180 Huntington, WV 25714-1180

422 Ninth Street, 3rd Floor Huntington, West Virginia 25701

phone: 304.654.8281 email: paul@farrell.law

"Facts are stubborn things."

-John Adams President of the United States. Trial lawyer

From: Flahive Wu, Laura < lflahivewu@cov.com> Sent: Wednesday, February 5, 2020 11:06 AM

To: Paul Farrell <paul@farrell.law>; Kearse, Anne <akearse@motleyrice.com>; Omar Aboulhosn

<Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Fuller, Mike <mike@mchughfuller.com>; Brandon Bogle

<bbogle@levinlaw.com>; Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com>; Mark Pifko <MPifko@baronbudd.com>

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>; sruby@baileyglasser.com; AJ

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) < jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale < drice@cov.com>; ct2\_opioid\_team@mail-list.com; Winner, Sonya < swinner@cov.com>; Lynch, Mark < mlynch@cov.com>

Subject: RE: EXTERNAL-RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn,

We respectfully submit that discovery rulings from the Summit/Cuyahoga cases in the MDL are not controlling, and certainly have no bearing to Huntington and Cabell's discovery obligations. To the extent plaintiffs wish to bring any aspect of the MDL record to the Court's attention, we suggest they do so in writing. We will be happy to discuss these issues during our conference on Friday.

Respectfully,

#### Laura Flahive Wu

Covington & Burling LLP One CityCenter, 850 Tenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-4956 T +1 202 662 5982 | lflahivewu@cov.com www.cov.com

# COVINGTON

This message is from a law firm and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please immediately advise the sender by reply e-mail that this message has been inadvertently transmitted to you and delete this e-mail from your system. Thank you for your cooperation.

From: Paul Farrell < paul@farrell.law >

Sent: Tuesday, February 04, 2020 5:13 PM

To: Kearse, Anne <a href="mailto:kearse@motleyrice.com">a kearse@motleyrice.com</a>; Flahive Wu, Laura <a href="mailto:kearse@motleyrice.com">kearse@motleyrice.com</a>; Flahive Wu, Laura <a href="ma

<<u>Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Fuller, Mike <<u>mike@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Brandon Bogle

<br/><bbogle@levinlaw.com>; Peter Mougey <pmougey@levinlaw.com>; Mark Pifko <MPifko@baronbudd.com>

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com >; Mainigi, Enu < EMainigi@wc.com >; sruby@baileyglasser.com; AJ

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

< Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. < LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>; ct2 opioid team@mail-

<u>list.com</u>; Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Lynch, Mark <<u>mlynch@cov.com</u>>

Subject: RE: EXTERNAL-RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

### [EXTERNAL]

Thank you Anne.

### A couple of pensees:

- 1. We tackled the problem of lawyers omitted from email strings many moons ago in CT1 by creating a list serve for the Defendants and the Plaintiffs. Since CT2 is comprised of a subset of parties, perhaps it makes sense to create a CT2 distribution list via listserve.
- 2. I have no problem discussing the discovery dispute (from the Distributor Defendants perspective) on Friday. I will be hard pressed to file a written response for the record. I will note that we have clearly set forth our position in Exhibit F to the Motion (Doc. #149-6) and prepared to stand by our position.
- 3. I would request the Distributor Defendants supplement the Motion to Compel by referencing the discovery rulings by Special Master Cohen (where applicable and controlling). All of the rulings are in the record and some have been

# Case 3:17-cv-01362 Document 158-1 Filed 02/11/20 Page 4 of 25 PageID #: 957

appealed and affirmed by Judge Polster. Those that were not appealed have full force and credit of the Court. I would like to understand which of the rulings the Distributor Defendants are seeking to overturn.

- 4. Please note that we will be filing our own motion to compel by way of letter for discussion <u>next</u> Friday. This motion will focus solely on the responses to *Plaintiffs'* (*First*) *Combined Discovery Request to Distributors* served on October 22, 2019. We will reference the prior discovery rulings where applicable. We ask the Distributor Defendants supplement their responses by this Friday or confirm that production is complete.
- 5. Moving forward, please note that I am the contact person for Cabell County and Anne Kearse is the contact person for the City of Huntington. Mike Fuller is the team leader for Cardinal Health. Brandon Bogle is the team leader for McKesson. Mark Pifko is the team leader for ABDC. Peter Mougey is the team leader and architect of the data.

Paul T. Farrell, Jr., Esq.

FARRELL LAW P.O. Box 1180 Huntington, WV 25714-1180

422 Ninth Street, 3rd Floor Huntington, West Virginia 25701

phone: 304.654.8281 email: paul@farrell.law

"Facts are stubborn things."

-John Adams
President of the United States.

Trial lawyer

Trial lawyer

From: Kearse, Anne <a href="mailto:kearse@motleyrice.com">akearse@motleyrice.com</a>>

Sent: Tuesday, February 4, 2020 3:39 PM

**To:** Flahive Wu, Laura < <a href="mailto:line">lilahivewu@cov.com</a>; Omar Aboulhosn</a> <a href="mailto:long">Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>; Fuller, Mike <a href="mailto:line">mike@mchughfuller.com</a>; Paul Farrell <a href="mailto:long">paul@farrell.law</a>>

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>; sruby@baileyglasser.com; AJ

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<<u>SBoranian@reedsmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@reedsmith.com</u>>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

<<u>Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) < jwakefield@flahertylegal.com >; Rice, Dale < drice@cov.com >; ct2 opioid team@mail-

<u>list.com</u>; Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Lynch, Mark <<u>mlynch@cov.com</u>>

Subject: RE: EXTERNAL-RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn and Counsel, I am copying Paul Farrell on this string of emails. He was inadvertently left off this chain. Anne

Anne McGinness Kearse | Attorney at Law | Motley Rice LLC 28 Bridgeside Blvd. | Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464 o. 843.216.9140 | f. 843.216.9655 | <a href="mailto:akearse@motleyrice.com">akearse@motleyrice.com</a>

From: Flahive Wu, Laura < <a href="mailto:lflahivewu@cov.com">lflahivewu@cov.com</a>>

Sent: Monday, February 3, 2020 3:42 PM

To: Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>>; Fuller, Mike < <a href="mailto:mike@mchughfuller.com">mike@mchughfuller.com</a>>

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>; sruby@baileyglasser.com; AJ

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne <akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>;

Heather Kropac < <a href="https://example.com">Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>; Porter, Luke S. < <a href="https://example.com">LPorter@reedsmith.com</a>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) < jwakefield@flahertylegal.com >; Rice, Dale < drice@cov.com >; ct2 opioid team@mail-

<u>list.com</u>; Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Lynch, Mark <<u>mlynch@cov.com</u>>

Subject: EXTERNAL-RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

### Judge Aboulhosn,

ABDC, Cardinal, and McKesson filed our motion to compel in anticipation that it would be referred to Your Honor (as was done with plaintiffs' prior motion). We recognize that the parties and the Court are still working out just how the informal discovery resolution process will be handled. It was and is not our intent to forego the informal process, and we will be prepared to discuss this motion during our call on Friday.

#### Respectfully,

#### Laura Flahive Wu

Covington & Burling LLP One CityCenter, 850 Tenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-4956 T +1 202 662 5982 | lflahivewu@cov.com www.cov.com

# COVINGTON

This message is from a law firm and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please immediately advise the sender by reply e-mail that this message has been inadvertently transmitted to you and delete this e-mail from your system. Thank you for your cooperation.

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Monday, February 03, 2020 11:57 AM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >; Flahive Wu, Laura < Iflahivewu@cov.com >

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>; sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne <akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>;

Heather Kropac < Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. < LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<<u>MSalimbene@reedsmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>; ct2 opioid team@mail-list.com

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

#### [EXTERNAL]

Counsel,

I just received a referrals of a Motions to Compel filed by Distributor Defendants regarding Plaintiffs' discovery responses.

Maybe I am missing the point of our weekly conferences. I was under the impression that discovery issues were to be included on an agenda for us to deal with each week. I was under the impression that doing so would negate the need for filing formal pleadings. If not, then what's the point of the conferences? Do the parties intend on filing Discovery related motions AND to also include the matters on the agenda?

I look forward to some clarification or we can just include that on the agenda topic for Friday.

Omar J. Aboulhosn United States Magistrate Judge



From: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com > Sent: Monday, February 03, 2020 9:56 AM

To: Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>>; Flahive Wu, Laura < <a href="mailto:Iflahivewu@cov.com">Iflahivewu@cov.com</a>>

**Cc:** Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mainted:SSalgado@wc.com">SSalgado@wc.com">SSalgado@wc.com</a>; Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainted:EMainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mainted:sruby@baileyglasser.com">sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>; <a href="mainted:A.J.Elkins">A.J.Elkins</a>

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani, Neelum <<u>NWadhwani@wc.com</u>>;

Heather Kropac < Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov >; Porter, Luke S. < LPorter@reedsmith.com >; Mincer, Jonathan

<<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>; Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<<u>MSalimbene@reedsmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>; Tammy Davis

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>; ct2 opioid team@mail-list.com

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge, for the benefit of all we have created <a href="mail-list.com">ct2 opioid team@mail-list.com</a> and added the list serve to the chain. This should include everyone on the Plaintiffs' side that will need notification for both offensive or defensive discovery issues. Therefore for future service for these conferences please email this list serve.

Thank you, Mike

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Monday, February 3, 2020 8:24 AM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >; Flahive Wu, Laura < | flahivewu@cov.com >

**Cc:** Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com >; Mainigi, Enu < Mainigi@wc.com >; sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins < AJ@mchughfuller.com >; Kearse, Anne < akearse@motleyrice.com >; Wadhwani, Neelum < NWadhwani@wc.com >; Heather Kropac < Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov >; Porter, Luke S. < LPorter@reedsmith.com >; Mincer, Jonathan

# 

- <JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.
- <SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.
- <<u>MSalimbene@reedsmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>; Tammy Davis
- <<u>Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Jeffrey Wakefield Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC (jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) < jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale < drice@cov.com>

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Folks the call in number is: 703-724-3100 PIN: 4005212# This will ALWAYS be the call in number for our conferences. Our first conference which will be recorded. Instead of call it an "informal" or "formal" conference, I plan on just calling it a conference. An order may or may not come about as a result of the conference depending on the issues to resolve and the resolution.

We will set the ground rules this Friday based upon the outline and suggestions made by counsel in the emails prior to this one.

The schedule for the month of February is as follow:

Friday, Feb. 7 @ 12 Noon

Thursday, Feb 13 @ 12 Noon (I will be on the road traveling but I will stop on the road and conduct the conference). Friday Feb. 21 @12 Noon.

Wednesday Feb 26 @ 12 Noon. (Note that the date is Wednesday. I am unable to do Thursday or Friday of that week.

March Schedule:

Friday, March 6 @ 12 Noon.

Friday March 13 @ 12 Noon.

Friday March 20 @ 12 Noon.

Friday March 27@ 12 Noon.

Thank you.

Omar J. Aboulhosn

United States Magistrate Judge



From: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com > Sent: Sunday, February 02, 2020 5:59 PM

To: Flahive Wu, Laura <a href="mailto:right-wull-cov.com">! Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov"> Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>

**Cc:** Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mainted-surange-sura

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani, Neelum <<u>NWadhwani@wc.com</u>>;

Heather Kropac < <a href="Heather-Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>; Porter, Luke S. < <a href="LPorter@reedsmith.com">LPorter@reedsmith.com</a>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

- <SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.
- <<u>MSalimbene@reedsmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>; Tammy Davis
- <Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

# Case 3:17-cv-01362 Document 158-1 Filed 02/11/20 Page 8 of 25 PageID #: 961

(<u>jwakefield@flahertylegal.com</u>) < <u>jwakefield@flahertylegal.com</u>>; Rice, Dale < <u>drice@cov.com</u>>; Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com>

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn,

While the Plaintiffs appreciate the process set out below we have to remember that this is an informal conference, not a hearing on the motion. In fact, if this is successful there will be no need for a motion to be filed. The discovery conferences in the MDL were for all practical purposes hearings from which orders were entered. Our understanding of your process is that it is less formal. For example the conference we had with you last Monday is not going to generate any order. You provided suggestions and the parties were able to reach agreements. We are also pleased to inform you that we have resolved all the issues surrounding the custodians and that process is underway. With that understanding and backdrop we do not believe there is a need for a formal briefing schedule as Mrs. Wu suggests. However, Mrs. Wu raises some valid points and two slight tweaks to our proposed process that we believe would address most of her concerns, if the Court is so inclined, would be as follows:

- Opposing party could provide a response by noon the next day to the issue raised. We could create a supplemental agenda for these added responses and provide them to all parties by the close of business that same day.
- Allowing the call to be recorded would ensure an accurate record of whatever agreements were reached on the
  call. We leave this issue to the Court, understanding that the Court may prefer no record for these informal
  discovery conferences.

Judge, just so you understand how we used this process in the MDL, this agenda is for organizational and tracking purposes more than anything else. It provides a consolidated tool for all pending issues. The parties can regularly submit issues to you and your staff directly, we will just ensure that they are captured for the agenda. If there is an issue that your or the parties believe is urgent then it can still be handled as such. Occasionally in the MDL there were issues with the timing of submissions, both parties agreeing to an additional meet and confer, or the Court was waiting for added information from one of the parties the agenda item would be carried over to the next week and it would be noted as such so that when you review the next week's agenda what occurred the prior week is clear. Additionally, the agenda items are not removed until you tell us to remove them or the parties agree that the issue is moot.

Finally, we don't believe that the volume will be nearly as high as it was in the MDL. That is simply because a lot of issues have been resolved.

Mike

From: Flahive Wu, Laura <lflahivewu@cov.com>

Sent: Sunday, February 2, 2020 2:36 PM

To: Omar Aboulhosn <Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Mike Fuller <Mike@mchughfuller.com>

**Cc:** Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mailto:Salgado@wc.com">Salgado@wc.com</a>; Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mailto:EMainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:sruby@baileyglasser.com">Sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>; A.J. Elkins <<a href="mailto:AJ@mchughfuller.com">AJ@mchughfuller.com</a>; Kearse, Anne <a href="mailto:akearse@motleyrice.com">akearse@motleyrice.com</a>; Wadhwani, Neelum <a href="mailto:NWadhwani@wc.com">NWadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">Wadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">Wadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">Wadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">Wadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">Wadhwani@wc.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearse@motleyrice.com">wakearse@motleyrice.com</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearsem">wakearsem</a>; <a href="mailto:www.akearsem">wakearsem</a>;

Heather Kropac <Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn,

# Case 3:17-cv-01362 Document 158-1 Filed 02/11/20 Page 9 of 25 PageID #: 962

Based on our experience with the discovery process in the MDL, which improved as the parties and Court collaborated to adjust the dispute process, we suggest the below modest adjustments to plaintiffs' proposal. We believe the suggested procedures will further streamline the dispute process, easing the burdens on the Court. We therefore propose the following ground rules:

- Our experience in the MDL was that submission of issues too close in time to a hearing or discovery conference was not sufficient, and sometimes led to confusion about which issues were ripe for resolution and/or did not give the parties enough time to express their positions. Based on that experience, we propose that a party wishing to place a dispute on the agenda for an upcoming discovery conference shall give written notice of that fact at least four business days before the hearing. Such notice shall be served on all parties and Judge Aboulhosn and shall concisely set forth the nature of the dispute, the relief requested, and the arguments in support of the request.
- A party against which a dispute has been asserted may submit and serve a response, which shall be due no later than **one business day** before the discovery conference. No additional submissions may be provided on the dispute in advance of the discovery conference; however, a party that believes there are new or additional points that it has not already addressed may give notice of the fact so that Judge Aboulhosn is aware that oral discussion and/or further submissions may be needed; such notice may not itself contain any argument or other substantive content.
- If a party requires urgent relief on a discovery dispute for which there is insufficient time to follow the procedures set forth above, it may email Judge Aboulhosn, with service on all counsel, concisely setting forth the nature of the dispute and the reason for urgency. Judge Aboulhosn shall give the opposing party an opportunity to be heard, either orally or in writing, before issuing a decision. If the Judge Aboulhosn determines that the matter is not urgent, he may direct that the dispute be submitted and heard according to the regular process.
- At the beginning of the MDL, discovery conferences were sometimes conducted off the record, or via informal discussion with the Special Master. At times, this led to unnecessary quarrels about rulings or agreements made. Later in the process, all discovery conferences with the Special Master were conducted on the record. Based on that experience, we propose that, unless explicitly agreed otherwise by all affected parties, there shall be no ex parte communications with the Court concerning the substance of any discovery dispute. Discovery conferences shall be held on the record (either through recording of a telephonic hearing or by a court reporter), and substantive communications not presented at hearings shall be presented solely in writing, with service on all parties.

We will be happy to discuss these proposals during our upcoming conference.

Respectfully,

### Laura Flahive Wu

Covington & Burling LLP One CityCenter, 850 Tenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-4956 T +1 202 662 5982 | lflahivewu@cov.com www.cov.com

## COVINGTON

This message is from a law firm and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please immediately advise the sender by reply e-mail that this message has been inadvertently transmitted to you and delete this e-mail from your system. Thank you for your cooperation.

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Saturday, February 01, 2020 9:50 AM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >

Cc: Flahive Wu, Laura < <a href="mailto:lflahivewu@cov.com">! Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mailto:sSalgado@wc.com">: Salgado@wc.com</a>; Mainigi, Enu

<<u>EMainigi@wc.com</u>>; <u>sruby@baileyglasser.com</u>; A.J. Elkins <<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne

<akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>; Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven J.

<<u>SBoranian@reedsmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@reedsmith.com</u>>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<MSalimbene@reedsmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>; Tammy Davis

< <u>Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>

Subject: Re: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

### [EXTERNAL]

I think the process utilized before and outlined by Mr. Fuller makes the most sense.

Let go with that. Talk to you all next Friday and will provide call in number and PIN on Monday.

Judge Omar J. Aboulhosn US Magistrate Judge United States District Court Southern District of WV

Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov

Cell: 304-320-4346 Sent from my iPad

On Feb 1, 2020, at 9:44 AM, Mike Fuller < <a href="mailto:Mike@mchughfuller.com">Mike@mchughfuller.com</a>> wrote:

All,

While we appreciate the Defendants willingness to discuss the system it doesn't seem that changing a system that worked in the MDL makes sense. If it is not broke don't fix it. That system worked very well and kept everything very organized and had to deal with much more volume that we anticipate here. Therefore, what we will anticipate doing as briefly explained below is that with your Honor's blessing we will call for a closing of submissions two days prior to the discovery conference, basically Wednesday at 5pm eastern (Tuesday for the Thursday conferences). This will enable us to finalize the submitted issues, organize them by defendant that evening, and provide them to the Court and all parties for review/preparation prior to the conference. The agenda will also include a submission of all the filings that have been done on the respective issue so that everything is in one place for ease of review.

This system worked very well in the MDL with 20 plus defendants and is still being utilized by SM Cohen. We will anticipate moving forward with the same system unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

Mike

From: Flahive Wu, Laura < <a href="mailto:lflahivewu@cov.com">lflahivewu@cov.com</a>>
Sent: Saturday, February 1, 2020 8:29 AM

To: Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>; Mike Fuller < <a href="mailto:Mike@mchughfuller.com">Mike@mchughfuller.com</a>>

**Cc:** Salgado, Suzanne <<u>SSalgado@wc.com</u>>; Mainigi, Enu <<u>EMainigi@wc.com</u>>;

## Case 3:17-cv-01362 Document 158-1 Filed 02/11/20 Page 11 of 25 PageID #: 964

sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins <AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne
<akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac
<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan

<JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian,

Steven J. <<u>SBoranian@reedsmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@reedsmith.com</u>>; Salimbene, Michael J.

 $<\!\!\underline{\mathsf{MSalimbene@reedsmith.com}}\!\!>\!; \mathsf{ZZ-Zerrusen}, \mathsf{Sandy} <\!\!\underline{\mathsf{skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com}}\!\!>\!; \mathsf{Tammy\ Davis}$ 

< <u>Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Jeffrey Wakefield - Flaherty Sensabaugh Bonasso PLLC

(jwakefield@flahertylegal.com) <jwakefield@flahertylegal.com>; Rice, Dale <drice@cov.com>

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn,

ABDC, Cardinal, and McKesson are available to participate in calls on Fridays at noon ET.

We will confer with plaintiffs about a process for submitting discovery disputes.

Respectfully,

#### Laura Flahive Wu

Covington & Burling LLP One CityCenter, 850 Tenth Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-4956 T +1 202 662 5982 | lflahivewu@cov.com www.cov.com

<image001.jpg>

This message is from a law firm and may contain information that is confidential or legally privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please immediately advise the sender by reply e-mail that this message has been inadvertently transmitted to you and delete this e-mail from your system. Thank you for your cooperation.

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

**Sent:** Saturday, February 01, 2020 9:07 AM **To:** Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>;

sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins <AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne

<akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Flahive Wu, Laura <|flahivewu@cov.com>; Porter, Luke S.

<LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan <JMincer@cov.com>; Winner, Sonya

<swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven J.

<SBoranian@reedsmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@reedsmith.com>; Salimbene, Michael J.

<<u>MSalimbene@reedsmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>; Tammy Davis

<Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Subject: Re: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

#### [EXTERNAL]

I am going to calendar all those dates for noon. On Monday my staff or I will send out the call in number and PIN.

Omar Aboulhosn United States Magistrate Judge Southern District of West Virginia On Feb 1, 2020, at 8:39 AM, Mike Fuller < <a href="mailto:Mike@mchughfuller.com">Mike@mchughfuller.com</a>> wrote:

Judge, we have been waiting since Wednesday for a response on this issue as to what day of the week the Defendants will agree to for a weekly discovery conference. In order to move this issue forward we would ask that they either agree to our proposal of Fridays at noon (except for the 14<sup>th</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup> which we should do on Thursday the 13<sup>th</sup> and 27<sup>th</sup> those weeks based on your Honor's schedule) or propose alternative dates and times be the end of the day.

We are available to discuss with the Defendants if they believe that is necessary and can reach me on my cell. 601-467-0788

Thanks and Happy Weekend, Mike

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 1:26 PM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >; Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com >

**Cc:** Mainigi, Enu < < EMainigi@wc.com >; sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < <u>NWadhwani@wc.com</u>>; Heather Kropac

<<u>Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>; Flahive Wu, Laura <<u>lflahivewu@cov.com</u>>;

Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan <JMincer@cov.com>;

Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven

J. <SBoranian@ReedSmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@ReedSmith.com>; Salimbene,

Michael J. < <a href="MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com</a>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy

<skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Thanks...

In order to keep everyone on the same page, please keep in mind that on both the 14 and the 28, if we chose Fridays at noon, I will be out of the office. We will either need to pick the Monday thereafter or pick another date for those two Fridays.

Omar

Omar J. Aboulhosn
United States Magistrate Judge
<image002.jpg>

From: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com > Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 2:23 PM

**To:** Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>>; Salgado, Suzanne

<SSalgado@wc.com>

Cc: Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@sruby@baileyglasser.com">sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@wc.com">A.J. Elkins</a>

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne <akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < <u>NWadhwani@wc.com</u>>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Flahive Wu, Laura <lflahivewu@cov.com>;

Porter, Luke S. <<u>LPorter@reedsmith.com</u>>; Mincer, Jonathan <<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>;

Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven J. <<u>SBoranian@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Salimbene, Michael J. <<u>MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com</u>>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy <<u>skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com</u>>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

I apologize, this was the thought on our side. I have not spoken to the Defendants on the date and time.

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov >

Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 1:19 PM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com>; Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com>

Cc: Mainigi, Enu <EMainigi@wc.com>; sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

< Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov >; Flahive Wu, Laura < Iflahivewu@cov.com >;

Porter, Luke S. <<u>LPorter@reedsmith.com</u>>; Mincer, Jonathan <<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>;

Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven

J. <SBoranian@ReedSmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@ReedSmith.com>; Salimbene,

Michael J. < <a href="MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com</a>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy

<skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Mr. Fuller,

Was this the joint consensus or just your vote for a Friday Noon event?

Omar J. Aboulhosn United States Magistrate Judge <image005.jpg>

From: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com > Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 2:16 PM

**To:** Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>>; Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mailto:SSalgado@wc.com">SSalgado@wc.com</a>>

**Cc:** Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@structure">sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>; A.J. Elkins <a href="mainigi@wc.com">AJ@mchughfuller.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@wc.com">Kearse</a>, Anne <a href="mainigi@wc.com">akearse@motleyrice.com</a>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Flahive Wu, Laura <lflahivewu@cov.com>;

Porter, Luke S. <<u>LPorter@reedsmith.com</u>>; Mincer, Jonathan <<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>;

Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven

J. <SBoranian@ReedSmith.com>; Gary, Brent R. <BGary@ReedSmith.com>; Salimbene,

Michael J. < <a href="MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com</a>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy

<skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Judge Aboulhosn,

We believe that the Friday noon hour will work very well. Probably should consider a noon cut off for submissions on the Wednesday before. This should enable us to prep the agenda and disseminate the agenda to everyone late Wednesday or early Thursday. This would sort of act as a docket for the Court and should provide a centralized place for all the submissions.

#### Mike

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 11:24 AM

To: Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mailto:Salgado@wc.com">Salgado@wc.com</a>; Mike Fuller < <a href="mailto:Mike@mchughfuller.com">Mike@mchughfuller.com</a>>

Cc: Mainigi, Enu < EMainigi@wc.com >; sruby@baileyglasser.com; A.J. Elkins

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Flahive Wu, Laura <\[flahivewu@cov.com>;\]

Porter, Luke S. <<u>LPorter@reedsmith.com</u>>; Mincer, Jonathan <<u>JMincer@cov.com</u>>;

Winner, Sonya <<u>swinner@cov.com</u>>; Keyes, Andy <<u>AKeyes@wc.com</u>>; Boranian, Steven

J. <<u>SBoranian@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Salimbene,

Michael J. < <a href="MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com">MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com</a>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy

<skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Thank you.

My thoughts are either a Monday Morning telephonic conference or a Friday Noon time conference depending on how the parties want to proceed.

But I am open to any other dates and times as well.

Omar J. Aboulhosn
United States Magistrate Judge
<image008.jpg>

From: Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com>

Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 12:21 PM

To: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Mike Fuller

<Mike@mchughfuller.com>

Cc: Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@struby@baileyglasser.com">struby@baileyglasser.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@wc.com">A.J. Elkins</a>

<AJ@mchughfuller.com>; Kearse, Anne <akearse@motleyrice.com>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < NWadhwani@wc.com>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Flahive Wu, Laura <|flahivewu@cov.com>;

Porter, Luke S. <LPorter@reedsmith.com>; Mincer, Jonathan <JMincer@cov.com>;

Winner, Sonya <swinner@cov.com>; Keyes, Andy <AKeyes@wc.com>; Boranian, Steven

J. <<u>SBoranian@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Gary, Brent R. <<u>BGary@ReedSmith.com</u>>; Salimbene,

Michael J. < MSalimbene@ReedSmith.com>; ZZ-Zerrusen, Sandy

<skzerrusen@jacksonkelly.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Magistrate Judge Aboulhosn and Counsel,

We are conferring on your question regarding timing, and also adding counsel for the other defendants to this email so that all the parties can weigh in on this matter.

Best, Suzanne

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 12:13 PM

To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >; Salgado, Suzanne < SSalgado@wc.com >

**Cc:** Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>>; <a href="mainigi@struby@baileyglasser.com">struby@baileyglasser.com</a>; A.J. Elkins

<<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>>; Wadhwani,

Neelum < <u>NWadhwani@wc.com</u>>; Heather Kropac

< Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov >

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al.

3:17-cv-01665

Counsel, is there a particular day and time that, from you past experience works best for a weekly conference? For example, is the lunch hour best or is an early morning best? Is Friday a better day for a conference versus a Monday?

Omar J. Aboulhosn
United States Magistrate Judge
<image009.jpg>

From: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com > Sent: Wednesday, January 29, 2020 2:29 AM

**To:** Omar Aboulhosn < <a href="mailto:Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov">Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>>; Salgado, Suzanne < <a href="mailto:SSalgado@wc.com">SSalgado@wc.com</a>>

**Cc:** Mainigi, Enu < <a href="mainigi@wc.com">EMainigi@wc.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@structure">sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>; A.J. Elkins <<a href="mainigi@wc.com">AJ@mchughfuller.com</a>; <a href="mainigi@wc.com">Kearse</a>, Anne <a href="mainigi@wc.com">akearse@motleyrice.com</a>; Wadhwani, Neelum <NWadhwani@wc.com</a>; Heather Kropac

<Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Mike Fuller <Mike@mchughfuller.com>

**Subject:** RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

## Your Honor,

After discussing the issue further with others on our side we would like to take you up on the offer to hold weekly discovery conferences at least for the next month or so to ensure we keep the process moving forward. We would suggest setting a standing day and time the best your judicial schedule would allow. What has seemed to work relatively well in the past was addressing these issues informally with letter/email briefings that forgo the formal motions. These letter/email briefings would generally be submitted two days prior to the discovery telecom. We can created an agenda at the close of the submission timeframe to assist the Court with the organization of these matters as well.

Please let us know if the Court has any questions or other suggestions on how it would like to conduct these weekly discovery conferences.

Mike

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

**Sent:** Tuesday, January 28, 2020 7:50 PM **To:** Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>

Kropac <Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Subject: Re: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al.

3:17-cv-01665

Thank you for the update.

With future emails, please include my law clerk, Heather Kropac (<a href="https://neather.kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov">heather kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov</a>). I have included her in this email so that she will have the entire email chain.

Thanks again. I look forward to hearing from you in a couple of weeks. I would ask that at that time the parties clearly state whether they agree that the issues in the motion to compel have been resolved so that the motion can be mooted.

Finally, I am glad to schedule weekly or bi-weekly conferences in this matter to assist with discovery issues. Please let me know if you would like to get those scheduled.

#### Sincerely

Judge Omar J. Aboulhosn
US Magistrate Judge
United States District Court
Southern District of WV

Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov

Cell: 304-320-4346 Sent from my iPad

On Jan 28, 2020, at 7:14 PM, Salgado, Suzanne <<u>SSalgado@wc.com</u>> wrote:

Magistrate Judge Aboulhosn and Counsel,

We appreciate having the opportunity to discuss these issues with everyone yesterday and look forward to working with one another. We write regarding our understanding of the issues covered yesterday and to provide the updates discussed.

### **Depositions**

As to the four requested depositions, we have worked to obtain the dates by which we can complete custodial productions of these individuals. Based on our understanding from Mr. Fuller at the hearing that we will be applying the same search terms here as those run in

Track 1 (adjusting of course to substitute the customer IDs of our Cabell/Huntington customers rather than those in Summit/Cuyahoga Counties), we have been told we can complete the production of these four custodial files by February 28. We will complete the review as quickly as possible and produce the documents on a rolling basis, but after consultation with our review team this is the earliest date by which we can commit to produce these thousands of documents. Per Mr. Fuller's email we are open to discussion regarding additional search terms, but note that the addition of terms may affect the anticipated timing of the productions. We also have confirmed that we will be able to produce previous transcripts of these witnesses from other state litigations by next Wednesday, February 5. As discussed, we are also working to obtain availability from these witnesses for dates for their respective depositions after their files have been produced, and we will promptly follow up with Plaintiffs on this when we hear back from the witnesses.

#### Custodian list and searches

Regarding custodians, as discussed we are sending to Plaintiffs today our proposed list of custodians and are happy to set up time to discuss any issues. We have already begun running the agreed-upon search terms across these custodians and will produce documents from these custodians on a rolling basis (in addition to the many non-custodial documents we have already produced and will continue to produce), starting with the files of those individuals whose depositions have been requested.

### Specific discovery requests

As to discovery responses 2, 10, and 11, we agree that we will supplement our response to request number 2 to reiterate what we explained in yesterday's discussion--that we have already provided the information we have regarding dates of Cardinal Health's SOMS policies and procedures, and that we will of course supplement if any additional information is discovered in the future. As to discovery responses 10 and 11, as discussed we are making reasonable inquiries for responsive documents in addition to running search terms that may yield responsive documents. We will follow up 14 days from yesterday's hearing to let Plaintiffs know if we identify any more information in response to these requests, and will of course supplement if relevant documents are identified in the future.

Thank you for your attention to these matters.

Best, Suzanne

From: Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Sent: Tuesday, January 28, 2020 6:07 AM
To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com>

Cc: Salgado, Suzanne <SSalgado@wc.com>; Mainigi, Enu

<<u>EMainigi@wc.com</u>>; <u>sruby@baileyglasser.com</u>; A.J. Elkins <<u>AJ@mchughfuller.com</u>>; Kearse, Anne <<u>akearse@motleyrice.com</u>> **Subject:** Re: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Thank you Mr. Fuller, this is perfect. I think it is very helpful to have this.

Judge Omar J. Aboulhosn
US Magistrate Judge
United States District Court
Southern District of WV

Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov

Cell: 304-320-4346 Sent from my iPad

On Jan 28, 2020, at 2:31 AM, Mike Fuller <Mike@mchughfuller.com> wrote:

Judge and Counsel,

Wanted to thank everyone for taking to time today to discuss the issues pending in Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel that was filed against Cardinal in this matter. As a result of those conversations it appears, as discussed today, that Plaintiffs' motion has or will become moot. To ensure that we are all on the same page as to what was worked out and agreed to we are providing the below summation.

As to depositions of Mone, Barber, Cameron, and Schrebe;

- By end of the day today, January 28<sup>th</sup>, Cardinal will provide further information as to the completion date for WV specific supplementation of custodial files for the first three deponents listed and Schrebe's complete custodial file.
- Dates for the production of transcripts of any of the requested witnesses.
- Will also be contacting the witnesses to provide dates for their respective depositions in this matter, understanding the your Honor indicated these depositions should look to be set the end of February or into the first part of March.

#### As to Custodian;

 Cardinal is going to provide the proposed custodians by name today, January 28<sup>th</sup>. We presume these custodians will cover the areas

- requested in our letter to Cardinal. We suggest setting a conference call just between the parties later this week to hammer out any issues as to the proposed custodians.
- As to the search terms to be used with these custodians, to move this process expeditiously, Plaintiffs have agreed to use the search terms from CT1. We believe there will need to be slight modifications for the CT2 specifics but that should be easily accomplished.

As to Discovery Requests #2, #10, & #11;

- #2: as to Cardinal's SOMS standard operating procedures (SOP) and providing information related to the timeframe of each. Cardinal will supplement their response to indicate that other than the dates on the policies and the testimony of the 30b witness and written 30b responses it cannot provide any additional information on the timeframe of used or chronological order of the produced SOPs.
- #10 & #11: Cardinal will do a search for responsive documents to these request, not relying on custodians and search terms, and will supplement their responses to these requests within 14 days of yesterday's hearing.

Your Honor, if the Court would prefer not to have an informal confirmation of the agreements reached today such as this, we apologize in advance. However, we have found that this seems to ensure that everyone is on the same page as to what needs to be done and when thing are due.

Thank you all, Mike

From: Omar Aboulhosn

<<u>Omar\_Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>

**Sent:** Monday, January 27, 2020 9:30 AM

**To:** Steven R. Ruby < <a href="mailto:sruby@baileyglasser.com">sruby@baileyglasser.com</a>>; Mike

Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >

Cc: Tammy Davis <Tammy\_Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>;

Amy Quezon <a href="mailto:amy@mchughfuller.com">amy@mchughfuller.com</a>;

amajestro@powellmajestro.com;

 $\underline{alamb@archielamb.com;}\ \underline{bert@greeneketchum.com;}$ 

bleblanc@baronbudd.com; dbailey@levinlaw.com;

jgaddy@levinlaw.com;

lbaughman@martinbaughman.com;

Idunning@levinlaw.com; mpifko@baronbudd.com; mikewoelfel3@gmail.com; nmcwilliams@levinlaw.com; ppoerschke@levinlaw.com; paul@greeneketchum.com; pmougey@levinlaw.com; rtellis@baronbudd.com;

rbudd@baronbudd.com; asaucer@baronbudd.com;

aemch@jacksonkelly.com;

esitarchuk morganlewis.com

<esitarchuk@morganlewis.com>;

gcallas@jacksonkelly.com;

meredith.auten@morganlewis.com;

smcclure@reedsmith.com;

schwendeman@theisenbrock.com;

cgoodwin@fbtlaw.com; jward@fbtlaw.com;

MarkCheffo@quinnemanuel.com;

richardschirtzer@quinnemanuel.com;

williamburck@quinnemanuel.com; Brian Glasser

<BGlasser@baileyglasser.com>;

ekessler@jonesday.com; emainigi@wc.com;

lheard@wc.com; jrwooley@jonesday.com;

spyser@wc.com; Raymond S. Franks II

<rfranks@baileyglasser.com>;

wjarceneaux@lewisglasser.com;

amacia@spilmanlaw.com; jcrockett@spilmanlaw.com;

mrhein@spilmanlaw.com; nlusk@spilmanlaw.com;

fshere@bowlesrice.com; gstowers@bowlesrice.com;

jreckart@bowlesrice.com; rharvey@bowlesrice.com;

ghobart@cov.com; iholliday@flahertylegal.com;

jwakefield@fsblaw.com; mbenov@cov.com;

alex.turner@nelsonmullins.com;

chris.smith@nelsonmullins.com;

dean.barnhard@btlaw.com; lmackey@btlaw.com;

marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com; Heather Kropac

< heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov >; Tammy Davis

<Tammy\_Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v.

AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-

01665

Counsel, immediately following Judge Faber's status hearing, I will be conducting an informal Video conference to discuss the pending motion to compel. Just FYI.

Thanks.

Omar J. Aboulhosn United States Magistrate Judge <image005.jpg>

From: Omar Aboulhosn

Sent: Monday, January 27, 2020 10:06 AM

To: Steven R. Ruby <sruby@baileyglasser.com>; Mike

Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com >

Cc: Tammy Davis <Tammy\_Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>;

Amy Quezon <amy@mchughfuller.com>;

amajestro@powellmajestro.com;

alamb@archielamb.com; bert@greeneketchum.com; bleblanc@baronbudd.com; dbailey@levinlaw.com; igaddy@levinlaw.com; lbaughman@martinbaughman.com; Idunning@levinlaw.com; mpifko@baronbudd.com; mikewoelfel3@gmail.com; nmcwilliams@levinlaw.com; ppoerschke@levinlaw.com; paul@greeneketchum.com; pmougey@levinlaw.com; rtellis@baronbudd.com; rbudd@baronbudd.com; asaucer@baronbudd.com; aemch@jacksonkelly.com; esitarchuk morganlewis.com <esitarchuk@morganlewis.com>; gcallas@jacksonkelly.com; meredith.auten@morganlewis.com; smcclure@reedsmith.com; schwendeman@theisenbrock.com; cgoodwin@fbtlaw.com; jward@fbtlaw.com; MarkCheffo@guinnemanuel.com; richardschirtzer@quinnemanuel.com; williamburck@guinnemanuel.com; Brian Glasser <BGlasser@baileyglasser.com>; ekessler@jonesday.com; emainigi@wc.com; lheard@wc.com; jrwooley@jonesday.com; spyser@wc.com; Raymond S. Franks II <rfranks@baileyglasser.com>; wjarceneaux@lewisglasser.com; amacia@spilmanlaw.com; jcrockett@spilmanlaw.com; mrhein@spilmanlaw.com; nlusk@spilmanlaw.com; fshere@bowlesrice.com; gstowers@bowlesrice.com; jreckart@bowlesrice.com; rharvey@bowlesrice.com; ghobart@cov.com; jholliday@flahertylegal.com; jwakefield@fsblaw.com; mbenov@cov.com; alex.turner@nelsonmullins.com; chris.smith@nelsonmullins.com; dean.barnhard@btlaw.com; lmackey@btlaw.com; marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com; Heather Kropac <Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Tammy Davis <Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov> Subject: RE: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

# Counsel,

I understand that there is a status hearing before Judge Faber this afternoon at 2:30. I am checking into the feasibility of videoconferencing in after you are done with Judge Faber to do an informal conference. My goal is to see if we can get the parties (I believe it is only Plaintiffs and Cardinal involved) to reach an agreement on these issues and get this matter resolved without TODAY without further briefing or futher hearings.

Please let me know ASAP if trying to conduct a video conference this afternoon after you are done with Judge Faber is problematic for the principals involved in this issue, namely the Plaintiffs and Cardinal.

#### Sincerely

Omar J. Aboulhosn United States Magistrate Judge <image006.jpg>

From: Steven R. Ruby <sruby@baileyglasser.com> Sent: Monday, January 27, 2020 8:54 AM To: Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com> Cc: Tammy Davis <Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Amy Quezon <amy@mchughfuller.com>; amajestro@powellmajestro.com; alamb@archielamb.com; bert@greeneketchum.com; bleblanc@baronbudd.com; dbailey@levinlaw.com; igaddy@levinlaw.com; Ibaughman@martinbaughman.com; Idunning@levinlaw.com; mpifko@baronbudd.com; mikewoelfel3@gmail.com; nmcwilliams@levinlaw.com; ppoerschke@levinlaw.com; paul@greeneketchum.com; pmougey@levinlaw.com; rtellis@baronbudd.com; rbudd@baronbudd.com; asaucer@baronbudd.com; aemch@jacksonkelly.com; esitarchuk\_morganlewis.com <esitarchuk@morganlewis.com>; gcallas@jacksonkelly.com; meredith.auten@morganlewis.com; smcclure@reedsmith.com; schwendeman@theisenbrock.com; cgoodwin@fbtlaw.com; jward@fbtlaw.com; MarkCheffo@quinnemanuel.com; richardschirtzer@guinnemanuel.com; williamburck@quinnemanuel.com; Brian Glasser <BGlasser@baileyglasser.com>; ekessler@jonesday.com; emainigi@wc.com; lheard@wc.com; jrwooley@jonesday.com; spyser@wc.com; Raymond S. Franks II <rfranks@baileyglasser.com>; wjarceneaux@lewisglasser.com; amacia@spilmanlaw.com; jcrockett@spilmanlaw.com; mrhein@spilmanlaw.com; nlusk@spilmanlaw.com; fshere@bowlesrice.com; gstowers@bowlesrice.com; ireckart@bowlesrice.com; rharvey@bowlesrice.com; ghobart@cov.com; jholliday@flahertylegal.com; jwakefield@fsblaw.com; mbenov@cov.com; alex.turner@nelsonmullins.com;

chris.smith@nelsonmullins.com;

dean.barnhard@btlaw.com; Imackey@btlaw.com; marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com; Omar Aboulhosn < Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov >; Heather Kropac < Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov > Subject: Re: Cabell County Commission v. AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-01665

Dear Ms. Davis:

Of the dates the Court proposed last week and those that plaintiffs proposed over the weekend, Feb. 3 after 2:00 p.m. would work best for Cardinal Health. Please let us know if a time in that range is suitable to the Court.

Sincerely, Steve Ruby

\_\_\_\_\_\_

Steven R. Ruby Bailey & Glasser LLP T: 304.345.6555

On Jan 26, 2020, at 3:45 AM, Mike Fuller <Mike@mchughfuller.com> wrote:

**CAUTION: External Email** 

Mrs. Davis, Plaintiffs can be available the for a conference at the following times:

Monday, Jan. 27th – afternoon, if scheduled around the status conference with Judge Faber at 2:30 p.m.
Thursday, Jan. 30th – a.m.
Monday, Feb. 3rd anytime after 12:00 p.m.
Tuesday, Feb. 4th – anytime after 12:00 p.m.

Thank you for your time and consideration Mike Fuller

From: Tammy Davis

<<u>Tammy Davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov</u>>
Sent: Friday, January 24, 2020 10:36 AM
To: Amy Quezon <amy@mchughfuller.com>;

amajestro@powellmajestro.com; alamb@archielamb.com; bert@greeneketchum.com; bleblanc@baronbudd.com; dbailey@levinlaw.com; igaddy@levinlaw.com; Ibaughman@martinbaughman.com; Idunning@levinlaw.com; mpifko@baronbudd.com; mikewoelfel3@gmail.com; nmcwilliams@levinlaw.com; ppoerschke@levinlaw.com; paul@greeneketchum.com; pmougey@levinlaw.com; rtellis@baronbudd.com; rbudd@baronbudd.com; asaucer@baronbudd.com; Mike Fuller < Mike@mchughfuller.com> Cc: aemch@jacksonkelly.com; esitarchuk morganlewis.com <esitarchuk@morganlewis.com>; gcallas@jacksonkelly.com; meredith.auten@morganlewis.com; smcclure@reedsmith.com; schwendeman@theisenbrock.com; cgoodwin@fbtlaw.com; jward@fbtlaw.com; MarkCheffo@quinnemanuel.com; richardschirtzer@guinnemanuel.com; williamburck@quinnemanuel.com; bglasser@baileyglasser.com; ekessler@jonesday.com; emainigi@wc.com; lheard@wc.com; jrwooley@jonesday.com; spyser@wc.com; sruby@baileyglasser.com; rfranks@baileyglasser.com; wiarceneaux@lewisglasser.com; amacia@spilmanlaw.com; jcrockett@spilmanlaw.com; mrhein@spilmanlaw.com; nlusk@spilmanlaw.com; fshere@bowlesrice.com; gstowers@bowlesrice.com; jreckart@bowlesrice.com; rharvey@bowlesrice.com; ghobart@cov.com; jholliday@flahertylegal.com; jwakefield@fsblaw.com; mbenov@cov.com; alex.turner@nelsonmullins.com; chris.smith@nelsonmullins.com; dean.barnhard@btlaw.com; lmackey@btlaw.com; marc.williams@nelsonmullins.com; Omar Aboulhosn <Omar Aboulhosn@wvsd.uscourts.gov>; Heather

Pursuant to the Standing Order entered in this case, all discovery related issues are referred to Magistrate Judge Aboulhosn. With regard to the Motion to Compel Discovery by Plaintiffs to Defendant Cardinal Health (ECF Document 126) it is the Judge's practice to have an informal conference on this matter prior to or in lieu of

a formal hearing to see if the parties can resolve their

AmerisourceBergen Drug Corporation, et al. 3:17-cv-

Kropac <Heather Kropac@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

Subject: Cabell County Commission v.

dispute.

01665

As this Motion was just filed today, and in keeping with the informal nature of the conference, the Judge will permit participation via telephone. See if the following dates/times work with your respective schedules to discuss the matters raised in Plaintiffs' Motion to Defendant Cardinal and let me know which days and times are preferred:

Monday, Jan. 27th – anytime Wednesday, Jan. 29th – anytime Thursday, Jan. 30th – a.m. Monday, Feb. 3rd anytime after 12:00 p.m. Tuesday, Feb. 4th – anytime after 12:00 p.m. Thursday, Feb. 6th – anytime Friday, Feb. 7th – anytime before 3:00 p.m.

Tammy Davis
Judicial Assistant & Courtroom Deputy for
U.S. Magistrate Judge Omar Aboulhosn
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
Southern District of West Virginia

Beckley: 304.253.8516 Bluefield: 304.327.0376 Charleston: 304.347.3460

tammy davis@wvsd.uscourts.gov<mailto:tammy davis

@wvsd.uscourts.gov>

This message and any attachments are intended only for the addressee and may contain information that is privileged and confidential. If you have received this message in error, please do not read, use, copy, distribute, or disclose the contents of the message and any attachments. Instead, please delete the message and any attachments and notify the sender immediately. Thank you.

## Confidential & Privileged

Unless otherwise indicated or obvious from its nature, the information contained in this communication is attorney-client privileged and confidential information/work product. This communication is intended for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this communication is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error or are not sure whether it is privileged, please immediately notify us by return e-mail and destroy any copies--electronic, paper or otherwise--which you may have of this communication.